

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 25 January 2024 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 19 January 2024.

Present: County Councillor Molik (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Brown-Reckless, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hinchey, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jones, K Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lay, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Lloyd Jones, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Jackie Parry, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Huw Thomas, Thomson, Lynda Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams and Wood

94 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Cllrs Gibson and Wong.

95 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were received in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

Name	Agenda item no.	Nature of interest	Reason for interest
Cllr Williams	8	Personal and Prejudicial	Member of the council's private rental leasing scheme
Cllr McEvoy	8	Personal	Employment as it involves Children's services and housing disrepair
Cllr Williams	9	Personal	Family Members employed by the Council.
Cllr Naughton	9	Personal	Family member employed by the Council
Cllr Carter	10	Personal	Family member employed in a school in Cardiff
Cllr Naughton	10	Personal	Family member employed in a school in Cardiff
Cllr Hunt	10	Personal	Local Authority School Governor
Cllrs Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Bradbury, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan,	10	Personal	Local Authority School Governor

Cunnah, De’Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hinchey, Hopkins, Humphreys, Jackie Jones, Owen Jones, Kaaba, Lancaster, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Helen Lloyd Jones, Mackie, McGarry, Melbourne, Moultrie, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Sangani, Shimmin, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Weaver, Wild, Williams and Wong			
Cllr Williams	10	Personal	Family member employed by the Council within Education
Cllr Naughton	11	Personal	Family member employed by the Council.

96 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting on 30th November 2023 were approved and signed by the Lord Mayor as a correct record.

97 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

There was one public question.

Richard Hainsworth to Cabinet Member for Investment and Development, Cllr Goodway

Despite promises of greater transparency from Cllr Goodway on 29th September 2022, why are local Cardiff Council taxpayers being deprived of detailed information about the viability of the Arena and the hotel and the wider Atlantic Wharf development?

Reply – Cllr Goodway

Lord Mayor, I do not accept the assertion that the Council has failed to be completely transparent regarding the costs and viability of the Arena development. The Council’s financial contribution towards the project remains within the financial envelope which was agreed when the original procurement was undertaken, details of which are in the public domain. All subsequent cost increases are being absorbed entirely by the developer.

Despite the recent movement in interest rates which have had a similar global impact on capital projects, including the Arena project, the recently agreed updated funding strategy is still forecast to deliver a small surplus to the Council over the full term of the lease. The lease to Live Nation is backed by a parent company guarantee from the Live Nation Group.

The Arena development is a catalyst for the wider development of Atlantic Wharf. Cabinet is yet to present the costs and financial viability of the wider Atlantic Wharf development as it is only part way through the development of a full business case which I hope to be able to present to Cabinet in the summer. Council will appreciate that where information provided to support a decision contains commercially sensitive information it will remain confidential and will only be made available to decision-makers and those appointed to scrutinise decisions, in order to protect the Council's commercial interests and those of its partners.

Supplementary question – Richard Hainsworth

Thank you for the opportunity to ask this supplementary question, we had anticipated an answer of this nature.

I referred to the date 29th September 2022 when a member of the Atlantic Wharf Residents' Association, Mr Graham Guthridge, also asked the public question and at that time Cllr Goodway said that he would make more available, there would be more detail about the viability of the Arena, and put it into the public domain. Despite this assertion, we have for the last 18 months been trying to find amongst the hundreds of documents that are associated with the whole Atlantic Wharf and Arena development, we have not found any of the information that we thought we had been promised.

So what we're looking at are things like how many people in total does the Council think it's going to be hiring for the Arena, what sort of social funding is going to be available, and I make these questions now because in the last week or so as you will all have noticed when you come in here, roads have been, not closed, there was a closure that caused a tailback, there has been vegetation removed. This whole area is full of quite affluent people with access to lots of lawyers.

We would like, as members of the Atlantic Wharf Residents' Association, some information that we can give to the dozens of people who are now complaining because their personal lives are being affected because the roads are being closed, and what we are looking for are sorts of information that are not commercial, and I do object to some of the ways in which this answer had been given, because it deflects from some of the information that we're asking for. We're asking for concrete data that isn't proprietary, but that will have gone into the viability of the Arena and the whole of the project which could be made public, and if the Council were to provide that information, would make it a lot easier for the residents to put up with the turmoil that's going to be caused by the Arena. The question is, can we get more detailed information?

Reply – Cllr Goodway

I will honour the commitment that I gave on 29th September 2022 at the appropriate time.

98 : PETITIONS

One petition was received.

Presented by	Number of relevant signatures	Nature of petition
Peter Fortune	275	Maintain or extend the opening hours of Radyr Hub

99 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Lord Mayor wished everyone a happy new year and hoped that they had enjoyed some quality time with loved ones during the festive season. Before Christmas, she had attended carol services and other events including the UCAN Fundraising Concert, and since the start of 2024 her duties had included citizenship ceremonies and medal presentations for Kings Awards at Mansion House. These awards recognised some wonderful people who had contributed and achieved greatly through their professional and voluntary work.

The Lord Mayor added that Cardiff was not only a capital city but also a city of sanctuary, and benefitted greatly from its diversity. Across the economy, all sectors benefitted from having a strong and diverse workforce of talents. Migration had been a good thing for Cardiff historically and it would continue to be a strength as the city continued to be welcoming and inclusive. This might bring short term challenges but in order to make long term gains they were prepared to face them. As a migrant herself, she knew that migrants arrived to make better of themselves and contribute to the society they lived in. It was a pleasure to celebrate their dedication and commitment every week during citizenship ceremonies.

On the fundraising front, UCAN Productions had held a concert just before Christmas at the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama featuring Rachel Starritt, a blind classical pianist, and many other young artists and talents. This had raised more than £1500, and she thanked all the young people involved and the councillors who had attended the event.

She had also recently attended the Philharmonic Orchestra's 'Night at the Movies' at the New Theatres, which had raised more than £500. The Club 1400 fundraising event at the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama had helped to raise over £5000, and she thanked Cllr Chowdhury and the executive team at Club 1400 for their efforts. She also thanked Cllr Michael for arranging a golf fundraiser, and welcomed any further support for UCAN.

100 : GOVERNANCE & AUDIT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2022/2023

Council was asked to note the annual report of the Governance and Audit Committee. The report was proposed by Gavin McArthur, Chair of the Committee.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Note the Governance and Audit Committee Annual Report 2022/2023.

101 : CABINET STATEMENTS

Leader's Statement

Cllr Thomas responded to questions in relation to:

- the Core Cities UK Cabinet meeting;
- the European Commission's Report on the Quality of Life in European Cities 2023; and
- the economic growth of the city and region.

Investment and Development Statement

Cllr Goodway responded to questions in relation to:

- the removal of rate relief for hospitality; and
- Cardiff East Park and Ride.

Tackling Poverty, Equality and Public Health Statement

Cllrs Bradbury and Sangani responded to questions in relation to:

- the 12 week fitness program for children aged 11-17;
- how services for young and vulnerable people were advertised; and
- tackling medical misinformation.

Transport and Strategic Planning Statement

Cllr De'Ath responded to questions in relation to:

- cycling enforcement on Queen Street;
- the end of the Nextbike scheme;
- temporary pothole repairs; and
- flood prevention works.

Social Services Statement

Cllrs Mackie and Lister responded to questions in relation to:

- the timeline of becoming a Neurodiverse Friendly City;
- child protection arrangements; and
- hospital discharges.

Climate Change Statement

Cllr Wild responded to questions in relation to:

- delivery of waste and recycling services;

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

- streets transitioning to segregated recycling; and
- taxi emissions.

Culture, Parks and Events Statement

Cllr Burke responded to questions in relation to:

- the opening of the Drovers Way play area in Radyr;
- Hammond Way play area in Penylan;
- improvement works on children's playgrounds; and
- the announcement of new skate parks.

Finance, Modernisation and Performance Statement

Cllr Weaver responded to questions in relation to:

- how the 2024/25 budget would affect schools;
- public engagement in the budget consultation; and
- the CardiffGov mobile app.

Housing and Communities Statement

Cllr Thorne responded to questions in relation to:

- bringing empty homes back into use;
- possible reductions in hours for Community Hubs;
- the condition of homeless accommodation in Cardiff Bay; and
- young adults in temporary accommodation.

102 : NOTICE OF MOTION – 1

The Lord Mayor noted that a Notice of Motion proposed by Cllr Lancaster and seconded by Cllr Melbourne had been received for consideration.

The Lord Mayor invited Cllr Lancaster to propose the Motion as follows:

This Council notes:

- Local Government funding is devolved to the Welsh Government.
- Cardiff has had the second highest increase in settlement from the Welsh Government of 4.1%, above the Welsh average.
- The increase in settlement by Welsh Government is partially offset by their withdrawal of some grant support.
- A projected funding gap of £30.5M for the forthcoming financial year.

This Council further notes:

- Council Tax rises place financial pressure on all households, particularly lower income ones.
- Non-Domestic Rates collected in Cardiff are pooled centrally by the Welsh Government and redistributed around Wales. Cardiff receives back less than it contributes.
- Proposals in the budget consultation include reduction in frontline services.

This Council resolves:

- To listen to residents' needs & focus on protecting and improving core services,

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

with the need to keep Council Tax as low as possible and deliver value for money.

- To oppose three-weekly black bin collections, charging a separate fee for the collection of garden waste, removal of litter bins and reduction of street cleaning.
- To eliminate our funding gap and improve core services by negotiating with Welsh Government to retain 100% of the Non-Domestic Rates collected by Cardiff Council.

The Motion was formally seconded by Cllr Melbourne.

An Amendment to the Motion had been received from the Liberal Democrat Group.

The Lord Mayor called upon Cllr Berman to move the amendment as follows:

Add the following new bullet point at the end of the section headed "This Council further notes":

- As the authority presses ahead with significantly increasing the level of borrowing it undertakes, the revenue costs of servicing that borrowing rise and this can have a knock-on effect by reducing the amount of revenue funding that is then available for the provision of frontline services.

The amended motion would read as follows:

This Council notes:

- Local Government funding is devolved to the Welsh Government.
- Cardiff has had the second highest increase in settlement from the Welsh Government of 4.1% above the Welsh average.
- The increase in settlement by Welsh Government is partially offset by their withdrawal of some grant support.
- A projected funding gap of £30.5M for the forthcoming financial year.

This Council further notes:

- Council Tax rises place financial pressures on all households, particularly lower income ones.
- Non-Domestic Rates collected in Cardiff are pooled centrally by the Welsh Government and redistributed around Wales. Cardiff receives back less than it contributes.
- Proposals in the budget consultation include reduction in front line services.
- As the authority presses ahead with significantly increasing the level of borrowing it undertakes, the revenue costs of servicing that borrowing rise and this can have a knock-on effect by reducing the amount of revenue funding that is then available for the provision of frontline services.

This Council resolves:

- To listen to residents' needs & focus on protecting and improving core services with the need to keep Council Tax as low as possible and deliver value for money.
- To oppose three-weekly black bin collections, charging a separate fee for the collection of garden waste, removal of litter bins and reduction of street cleaning.
- To eliminate our funding gap and improve core services by negotiating with Welsh Government to retain 100% of the on-Domestic Rates collected by

Cardiff Council.

The Amendment was formally seconded by Cllr Carter.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the Motion and Amendment.

The Lord Mayor invited Cllr Lancaster to respond to the issues raised during the debate. He confirmed that the Amendment was accepted.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the Substantive Motion as amended by Cllr Berman and seconded by Cllr Carter.

FOR (20)

Councillors Berman, Brown-Reckless, Carter, Cowan, Davies, Driscoll, Hopkins, Lancaster, Latif, Littlechild, Melbourne, Naughton, Owen, Reid-Jones, Robson, Shimmin, Taylor, Waldron, Williams and Wood

AGAINST (50)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Cunnah, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hinchey, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lay, Lewis, Lister, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Palmer, Proctor, Robinson, Sangani, Sattar, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Weaver and Wild

ABSTAIN (1)

Councillor Livesy

The vote on the Motion was LOST.

103 : NOTICE OF MOTION - 2

The Lord Mayor noted that a Notice of Motion proposed by Cllr Berman and seconded by Cllr Hopkins had been received for consideration.

The Lord Mayor invited Cllr Berman to propose the Motion as follows:

This Council notes that:

- 1) In financial year 2023-2024, one special school, 35 primary schools and two secondary schools set deficit budgets at the outset.
- 2) Many other schools were able to set a balanced budget only through the one-off use of their reserves.
- 3) The proportion of schools having to set a deficit budget is unprecedented.
- 4) Given the concerns expressed about the significant budget gap for the council as a whole in 2024-2025 and warnings given to the council's school budget forum, there are widespread fears that the situation will only worsen with even more schools falling into deficit.
- 5) Employee costs account for between 80% and 90% of schools' budgets.
- 6) Schools are still continuing to work hard to recover from the Covid-19 pandemic and are dealing with multiple demands and pressures as a result. These demands include the need to: improve attendance which at the end of

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

the 2023 academic year was 6% below pre-pandemic levels in secondary schools and 5% in primary schools; engage with families to increase support for vulnerable pupils; improve help for the mental health and well-being of children and young people.

- 7) Schools' leaders and teachers are heavily involved in the implementation of curriculum reform and reform to the provision for pupils with additional learning needs.
- 8) The current Medium Term Financial Plan places the council on a continuing trajectory of significantly increasing its level of borrowing together with associated revenue costs, whilst the Cabinet has also recently committed to fund around half of its agreed £27.3 million capital contribution towards the planned new Indoor Arena through undertaking additional borrowing, and this is having a significant knock-on effect on the availability of revenue funding for key council services including for schools' delegated budgets. £1.5 million of annual revenue funding is already contained within the council's base revenue budget to cover borrowing costs associated with the Indoor Arena project and the Cabinet has now agreed that the revenue provision for this borrowing in the budget should increase to £2.9 million a year during the construction phase and early years of the project.

This Council believes that:

- 1) All schools must have the resources necessary to maintain a high quality of education.
- 2) This requires a level of delegated funding that will avoid damaging job losses and safeguard the capacity of schools to meet the needs of all their pupils.
- 3) The Welsh Government should develop a longer-term Covid-19 recovery plan that recognises the impact that the pandemic has had, and continues to have, on each and every school.
- 4) Action is needed if Cardiff is to protect its status as the UK's first city to be awarded Child Friendly City Status.
- 5) A situation where schools increasingly need to rely on setting deficit budgets to operate is simply not sustainable.

This council calls on the Cabinet to bring forward a funding strategy as part of the council's future budget consideration that ensures Cardiff's schools can be more adequately funded in order that the proportion of the city's schools that need to set deficit budgets can be substantially reduced.

The Motion was formally seconded by Cllr Hopkins.

An Amendment to the Motion had been received from the Labour Group.

The Lord Mayor called upon Cllr Merry to move the amendment as follows:

After 'This Council notes', add the following:

1. Education has been a key priority of the current administration.
2. Education in Cardiff made strides in education over the last ten years going from below the Welsh average on many of the key performance indicators to above – progress that was recognised during the latest Estyn inspection. Cardiff has also recently been recognised as the first UNICEF Child Friendly City in the UK for prioritising the voices of children and young people.
3. Cardiff has the highest delegation rate to schools in Wales and education and social services accounted for 66% of the council's budget in 2023/24 with the council has seeking to protect funding for education and services for
This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

our most vulnerable children.

4. Funding of our schools not only comes from the local authority but a significant component comes from grants from Welsh Government which have reduced in value over the last few years. We are waiting to hear the outcome of the reorganisations of grants being undertaken to simplify the process for schools but this must protect funding for our most vulnerable pupils.

Combine bullet points 1-5 and delete and amend as below:

5. In financial year 2023-2024, one special school, 35 primary schools and two secondary schools set deficit budgets at the outset

Insert *this is a situation repeated across the UK. With many other schools **Delete** were able to set a balanced budget only through the one-off use of their reserves.*

Delete *The proportion of schools having to set a deficit budget is unprecedented. Given the concerns expressed about the significant budget gap for the council as a whole in 2024-2025 and warnings given to the council's school budget forum, there are widespread*

Insert *with widespread fears that the situation will only worsen with even more schools falling into deficit. The teacher's pay increase should be fully funded by the Welsh Government*

6. Employee costs account for between 80% and 90% of schools' budgets.

7. Schools are still continuing to work hard to recover from the Covid-19 pandemic

Insert *and the cost of living crisis*

and are dealing with multiple demands and pressures as a result. These demands include the need to: improve attendance which at the end of the 2023 academic year was 6% below pre-pandemic levels in secondary schools and 5% in primary schools; engage with families to increase support for vulnerable pupils; improve help for the mental health and well-being of children and young people.

Insert *We note the importance of the partnership working between education youth and children's services at a time when budgets are under pressure.*

8. Schools' leaders and teachers are heavily involved in the implementation of curriculum reform and reform to the provision for pupils with additional learning needs

Insert *The Welsh Government should ensure it adequately funds curriculum and ALN reform.*

9. **Insert** *We thank school leaders for their work on the budget forum and working parties given the concerns about addressing the current financial situation. It is absolutely essential that while calling for more funding for education we continue to work together with our schools to protect children and young people and to continue to deliver improvements in education through innovative practice such as that shown by Cardiff Commitment.*

10. **Delete** *The current Medium Term Financial Plan places the council on a continuing trajectory of significantly increasing its level of borrowing together with associated revenue costs, whilst the Cabinet has also recently committed to fund around half of its agreed £27.3 million capital contribution towards the planned new Indoor Arena through undertaking additional borrowing, and this is having a significant knock-on effect on the availability of revenue funding for key council services including for schools' delegated budgets. £1.5 million of annual revenue funding is already contained within the council's base revenue budget to cover borrowing costs associated with the Indoor Arena project and the Cabinet has now agreed that the revenue*

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

- provision for this borrowing in the budget should increase to £2.9 million a year during the construction phase and early years of the*
11. **Insert** *This council notes the recent letter to the UK Government by 40 MP's asking for further funding for local authorities and calls on the council to continue to lobby Welsh Government and the UK Government over the importance of funding for education and services for our most vulnerable children*

This Council believes that:

- 1) All schools must have the resources necessary to maintain a high quality of education.
- 2) This requires a level of delegated funding that will avoid damaging job losses and safeguard the capacity of schools to meet the needs of all their pupils.
- 3) The Welsh Government should develop a longer-term Covid-19 recovery plan that recognises the impact that the pandemic has had, and continues to have, on each and every school
Insert *and work collaboratively with local Government to address the impact of Covid 19 and the cost of living crisis on our children and young people.*
- 4) **Delete** *Action is needed if Cardiff is to protect its status as the UK's first city to be awarded Child Friendly City Status. Insert Cardiff will continue to ensure that in line with our Child Friendly City Status the voices of young people are heard when deciding funding priorities.*
- 5) A situation where schools increasingly need to rely on setting deficit budgets to operate is simply not sustainable.
Insert *Cardiff Council will continue to prioritise Education funding and will work with and engage with our school leaders and Governors to support them in setting balanced budgets whilst maintaining and improving standards and protecting the best interests of our children.*

Delete

This Council calls on the Cabinet to bring forward a funding strategy as part of the Council's future budget consideration that ensures Cardiff's schools can be more adequately funded in order that the proportion of the city's schools that need to set deficit budgets can be substantially reduced.

Insert

This Council calls on the Council to write to both the UK and Welsh Government in line with the recent letter by 40 Conservative MPs to Rishi Sunak for further funding for councils to avoid cuts in services.

This Council calls on the Council to sign up to the NAHT's 'In this Together' pledge – committing to work with the education workforce to lobby for more funding to better education for all.

The amended motion would read as follows:

This Council notes:

1. Education has been a key priority of the current administration.
2. Education in Cardiff made strides in education over the last ten years going from below the Welsh average on many of the key performance indicators to above – progress that was recognised during the latest Estyn inspection. Cardiff has also recently been recognised as the first UNICEF Child Friendly City in the UK for prioritising the voices of children and young people.
3. Cardiff has the highest delegation rate to schools in Wales and education and social services accounted for 66% of the council's budget in 2023/24

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

with the council has seeking to protect funding for education and services for our most vulnerable children.

4. Funding of our schools not only comes from the local authority but a significant component comes from grants from Welsh Government which have reduced in value over the last few years. We are waiting to hear the outcome of the reorganisations of grants being undertaken to simplify the process for schools but this must protect funding for our most vulnerable pupils.
5. In financial year 2023-2024, one special school, 35 primary schools and two secondary schools set deficit budgets at the outset this is a situation repeated across the UK. With many other schools able to set a balanced budget only through the one-off use of their reserves. with widespread fears that the situation will only worsen with even more schools falling into deficit. The teacher's pay increase should be fully funded by the Welsh Government.
6. Employee costs account for between 80% and 90% of schools' budgets.
7. Schools are still continuing to work hard to recover from the Covid-19 pandemic and the cost of living crisis and are dealing with multiple demands and pressures as a result. These demands include the need to: improve attendance which at the end of the 2023 academic year was 6% below pre-pandemic levels in secondary schools and 5% in primary schools; engage with families to increase support for vulnerable pupils; improve help for the mental health and well-being of children and young people. We note the importance of the partnership working between education youth and children's services at a time when budgets are under pressure.
8. Schools' leaders and teachers are heavily involved in the implementation of curriculum reform and reform to the provision for pupils with additional learning needs The Welsh Government should ensure it adequately funds curriculum and ALN reform.
9. We thank school leaders for their work on the budget forum and working parties given the concerns about addressing the current financial situation. It is absolutely essential that while calling for more funding for education we continue to work together with our schools to protect children and young people and to continue to deliver improvements in education through innovative practice such as that shown by Cardiff Commitment.
10. This council notes the recent letter to the UK Government by 40 MP's asking for further funding for local authorities and calls on the council to continue to lobby Welsh Government and the UK Government over the importance of funding for education and services for our most vulnerable children.

This Council believes that:

1. All schools must have the resources necessary to maintain a high quality of education.
2. This requires a level of delegated funding that will avoid damaging job losses and safeguard the capacity of schools to meet the needs of all their pupils.
3. The Welsh Government should develop a longer-term Covid-19 recovery plan that recognises the impact that the pandemic has had, and continues to have, on each and every school and work collaboratively with local Government to address the impact of Covid 19 and the cost of living crisis on our children and young people.
4. Cardiff will continue to ensure that in line with our Child Friendly City Status the voices of young people are heard when deciding funding priorities.
5. A situation where schools increasingly need to rely on setting deficit budgets to operate is simply not sustainable. Cardiff Council will continue to prioritise Education funding, and will work with and engage with our school leaders

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

and Governors to support them in setting balanced budgets whilst maintaining and improving standards and protecting the best interests of our children.

This Council calls on the Council to write to both the UK and Welsh Government in line with the recent letter by 40 Conservative MPs to Rishi Sunak for further funding for councils to avoid cuts in services.

This Council calls on the Council to sign up to the NAHT's 'In this Together' pledge – committing to work with the education workforce to lobby for more funding to better education for all.

The Amendment was formally seconded by Cllr Bridgeman.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the Motion and Amendment.

The Lord Mayor invited Cllr Berman to respond to the issues raised during the debate. He confirmed that the Amendment was not accepted.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the Amendment.

FOR (49)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Chowdhury, Cunnah, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lay, Lister, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Palmer, Parry, Proctor, Robinson, Sangani, Sattar, Simmons, Stubbs, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Weaver and Wild

AGAINST (23)

Councillors Berman, Brown-Reckless, Carter, Cowan, Davies, Driscoll, Hinchey, Hopkins, Lancaster, Latif, Littlechild, Livesy, McEvoy, Melbourne, Naughton, Owen, Reid-Jones, Robson, Shimmin, Taylor, Waldron, Williams and Wood

ABSTAIN (0)

The vote on the Amendment was CARRIED.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the Motion as amended by Cllr Merry and seconded by Cllr Bridgeman.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the Motion

FOR (58)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Carter, Cunnah, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Latif, Lay, Lewis, Lister, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Moultrie,

Naughton, Palmer, Proctor, Robinson, Sangani, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild and Wood

AGAINST (14)

Councillors Brown-Reckless, Cowan, Davies, Driscoll, Hinchey, Lancaster, Littlechild, McEvoy, Melbourne, Owen, Reid-Jones, Robson, Sattar and Williams

ABSTAIN (0)

The vote on the Motion was CARRIED.

104 : NOTICE OF MOTION - 3

The Lord Mayor noted that a Notice of Motion proposed by Cllr Moultrie and seconded by Cllr Green had been received for consideration.

The Lord Mayor invited Cllr Moultrie to propose the Motion as follows:

Local Authorities across the country such as Cardiff are currently preparing their annual budgets for 2024/25.

After 13 years of public sector austerity by the Conservative-led UK Government, exacerbated in recent years by the continued impact of Brexit, the long tail of the Pandemic, rampant inflation, and stagnant growth, Councils now face unprecedented levels of demand but wholly insufficient funding. Such is the severity of the situation, that several councils in England have issued Section 114 notices to severely curtail day-to-day spending.

Cardiff Council has faced a cumulative budget gap of over £300 million since 2010, and prudent, decisive action has been needed to protect the Council's financial resilience, whilst still delivering an ambitious Stronger, Fairer, Greener vision.

In particular, the Council notes:

- The continued improvements delivered within our schools, which has seen a dramatic reduction in the number of schools in Estyn Monitoring, NEET figures held at near historically low levels, exam results now comfortably above the Welsh average, and the sustained investment over 11 years into both our schools and the Education estate.
 - The progress made in support of children who are looked after, in particular the careful expansion of kinship care, and the delivery of the accommodation strategy. This work is improving the Council's ability to home and care for our most vulnerable young people closer to home.
 - The rebuilding of our Youth Service capacity, with budget growth across multiple years, and proposed protection to the service in the forthcoming financial year, enabling the service to build on the success of initiatives like the Cardiff Commitment and the UNICEF Child-Friendly City award to ensure all our young people, regardless of background, can benefit from the opportunities our city offers.
 - The pioneering partnership work between our Social Services teams and the NHS which enables timely discharges from hospital to mitigate against Winter Pressures. This partnership ensures our older people - particularly those with conditions such as dementia - get the specialised care they need, and which is supporting people to live independently at home, with a better quality of life, for
- This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

- longer.
- The success of our award winning Council House building programme, which is transforming lives and communities in every part of Cardiff, and which is also supporting the delivery – at scale – of innovative and rapid housing solutions to help address the latest homelessness crisis affecting all cities.
 - All of this is and more is delivered with the Council setting amongst the lowest Council Tax levels in Wales.

Nevertheless, despite the relative protection afforded by the Welsh Government to local authorities, the latest budget round leaves the Council facing significant challenges, and difficult decisions, the results of which residents will feel keenly.

Therefore this Council resolves to:

1. Condemn the continued attack on local government finances by the Conservative UK Government, and the detrimental impact this has on the provision of public services;
2. Call on the Chancellor of the Exchequer to announce additional resources targeted at local authorities in his March budget.
3. Endorse the proposed prioritisation of Education and Social Services, as set out within the 2024/25 Budget Update report to Cabinet, but notes any further cuts to local authority funding will leave many non-statutory areas of Council spending essentially “on life-support” until a change of direction is secured at UK Government level.
4. Welcome efforts by Welsh Government to protect Welsh local authorities as far as possible, and calls on the future First Minister to continue this approach, with a particular focus on supporting preventative services.

The Motion was formally seconded by Cllr Green.

An Amendment to the Motion had been received from the Liberal Democrat Group.

The Lord Mayor called upon Cllr Taylor to move the amendment as follows:

The amendment makes revisions to the final two bullet points of the motion under "Therefore this Council resolves to:". The revised wording is provided below.

- Bring forward a funding strategy to ensure adequate funding for the city's schools with the proportion of schools needing to set deficit budgets significantly reduced, ensure that the 2024-2025 budget provides protection for Social Services, but notes any further cuts to local authority funding will leave many non-statutory areas of Council spending essentially “on life-support” until a change of direction is secured at UK Government level.
- Call on the future First Minister to do more to protect local government funding, with a particular focus on supporting preventative services, noting that, as highlighted by the Welsh Local Government Association, real terms funding for Welsh local government was 12% lower in 2023-24 than in 2009- 10 against a backdrop of a 5% real terms increase in the overall Welsh Government budget during the same period.

The amended motion would read as follows:

Local Authorities across the country such as Cardiff are currently preparing their annual budgets for 2024/25.

After 13 years of public sector austerity by the Conservative-led UK Government, exacerbated in recent years by the continued impact of Brexit, the long tail of the Pandemic, rampant inflation, and stagnant growth, Councils now face unprecedented levels of demand but wholly insufficient funding. Such is the severity of the situation, that several councils in England have issued Section 114 notices to severely curtail day-to-day spending.

Cardiff Council has faced a cumulative budget gap of over £300 million since 2010, and prudent, decisive action has been needed to protect the Council's financial resilience, whilst still delivering an ambitious Stronger, Fairer, Greener vision.

In particular, the Council notes:

- The continued improvements delivered within our schools, which has seen a dramatic reduction in the number of schools in Estyn Monitoring, NEET figures held at near historically low levels, exam results now comfortably above the Welsh average, and the sustained investment over 11 years into both our schools and the Education estate.
- The progress made in support of children who are looked after, in particular the careful expansion of kinship care, and the delivery of the accommodation strategy. This work is improving the Council's ability to home and care for our most vulnerable young people closer to home.
- The rebuilding of our Youth Service capacity, with budget growth across multiple years, and proposed protection to the service in the forthcoming financial year, enabling the service to build on the success of initiatives like the Cardiff Commitment and the UNICEF Child-Friendly City award to ensure all our young people, regardless of background, can benefit from the opportunities our city offers.
- The pioneering partnership work between our Social Services teams and the NHS which enables timely discharges from hospital to mitigate against Winter Pressures. This partnership ensures our older people - particularly those with conditions such as dementia - get the specialised care they need, and which is supporting people to live independently at home, with a better quality of life, for longer.
- The success of our award winning Council House building programme, which is transforming lives and communities in every part of Cardiff, and which is also supporting the delivery – at scale – of innovative and rapid housing solutions to help address the latest homelessness crisis affecting all cities.
- All of this is and more is delivered with the Council setting amongst the lowest Council Tax levels in Wales.

Nevertheless, despite the relative protection afforded by the Welsh Government to local authorities, the latest budget round leaves the Council facing significant challenges and difficult decisions, the results of which residents will feel keenly.

Therefore this Council resolves to:

- Condemn the continued attack on local government finances by the Conservative UK Government, and the detrimental impact this has on the provision of public services;
- Call on the Chancellor of the Exchequer to announce additional resources targeted at local authorities in his March budget.
- Bring forward a funding strategy to ensure adequate funding for the city's schools with the proportion of schools needing to set deficit budgets significantly reduced, ensure that the 2024-2025 budget provides protection for Social Services, but notes any further cuts to local authority funding will leave

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

many non-statutory areas of Council spending essentially “on life-support” until a change of direction is secured at UK Government level.

- Call on the future First Minister to do more to protect local government funding, with a particular focus on supporting preventative services, noting that, as highlighted by the Welsh Local Government Association, real terms funding for Welsh local government was 12% lower in 2023-24 than in 2009- 10 against a backdrop of a 5% real terms increase in the overall Welsh Government budget during the same period.

The Amendment was formally seconded by Cllr Berman.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the Motion and Amendment.

The Lord Mayor invited Cllr Moultrie to respond to the issues raised during the debate. She confirmed that the Amendment was not accepted.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the Amendment.

FOR (16)

Councillors Berman, Boes, Carter, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Hopkins, Latif, Livesy, McEvoy, Naughton, Shimmin, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Waldron and Wood

AGAINST (58)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Brown-Reckless, Burke, Carr, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De’Ath, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hinchey, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Lay, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Mackie, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Owen, Palmer, Parry, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Simmons, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Weaver, Wild and Williams

ABSTAIN (0)

The vote on the Amendment was LOST.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the Motion.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the Motion.

FOR (53)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Chowdhury, Cunnah, De’Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Goodway, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hinchey, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jackie Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lay, Lewis, Lister, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Palmer, Parry, Proctor, Robinson, Sangani, Sattar, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Weaver and Wild

AGAINST (11)

Councillors Brown-Reckless, Cowan, Davies, Driscoll, Lancaster, Littlechild, Melbourne, Owen, Reid-Jones, Robson and Williams

ABSTAIN (9)

Councillors Berman, Carter, Hopkins, Latif, Naughton, Shimmin, Taylor, Waldron and Wood

The vote on the Motion was CARRIED.

105 : ORAL QUESTIONS

Cllr Davies to Cllr Goodway, Cabinet Member for Investment & Development

Will the Cabinet Member for Investment & Development provide an update on the status of Cardiff Parkway Station following the call-in of the application by the Welsh Government?

Reply – Cllr Goodway

I can confirm that an update to Chapter 6 of Planning Policy Wales (PPW) was published on 18 October last, following which the Welsh Ministers requested that the appointed Inspector revisit his previously submitted recommendation that the application be granted, to take account of these policy changes. I understand that the changes related to a bid to strengthen the policy in respect of Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSIs).

The Council will be aware that on Tuesday 16 January 2024, the appointed Inspector reconvened the hearing, which originally sat in July 2023, and which was attended by council officers, the applicant and interested local groups. I am advised that a detailed discussion on all the relevant issues took place during the hearing.

The Inspector will now submit his revised report to Welsh Ministers. The timescale for Ministerial decision is unknown, but it is hoped that a decision will be taken swiftly to allow this important project to move forward at pace.

Cardiff Parkway's potential impact on the city's economy and that of the region, is clearly demonstrated by the recent statement by Rolls Royce Submarines, which was made available to the Inspector of its intention to locate its base for a new UK satellite office on the St Mellons site. The company has emphasised that in arriving at its decision the company was influenced by the region's current talent pool and Parkway's potential, through its rail infrastructure, to extend their catchment area for talent.

In short, it's a no-brainer this application gets granted and I urge Welsh Ministers to approve the application without further delay.

Supplementary – Cllr Davies

It sounds like we agree on much Cllr Goodway because it's an essential piece of infrastructure to grow our regional economy and limit traffic in our congested city centre. Of course, from what I've read, originally this was supposed to be open to the public already this year, but thanks to the Labour Government's decision, you know we're still waiting for spade in the ground. It's a shame really because, along with

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

further limiting funds for bus services before franchising, banning road-building and imposing 20mph default speed limits, we see the Labour Government's mad and bad decision-making affecting the ability of councils to pursue paths of economic growth. So would the Cllr agree with me that we need to see less Welsh Government interference in Council decisions, and also could he tell us how many years of delay should we expect because of the current call-in?

Reply – Cllr Goodway

I don't expect to wait very long at all because there's already been far too long a delay in getting a decision on this particular matter. I reiterate what I said a few moments ago that, as far as I'm concerned, is that I want to see more devolution to local government and less centralisation, and this is a classic example of the things that ought to be decided at local government level.

Cllr Latif to Cllr Huw Thomas, Leader of the Council

Can the council update us as to what actions it has taken since the last council meeting to resolve the situation with the Unite union to end its on-going strike, and what are the exact hurdles to reaching a resolution given that it's affecting the hygiene and cleanliness of the whole city?

Reply – Cllr Huw Thomas

The Council's continued to engage with Unite over the period on a number of levels informally and formally, and indeed we have sought to move forward with a number of the proposals we have offered to Unite to resolve the dispute, and we have implemented them. For example, improving the position for agency workers with a decrease from 24 months to 12 months before they are offered a temporary contract with a further commitment that we will review that again once we have a greater understanding of the budget implications post the final settlements. We have introduced the new rates of the real living wage early from the start of January to make sure that the lowest members of our staff, responding to the concerns about cost of living, get paid the new real living wage early, as opposed to the April original implementation dates. We do absolutely take incredibly seriously the concerns around culture and bullying, and that's why we've moved forward with commissioning a barrister-led investigation into allegations of widespread bullying within the service. Terms of reference for that have been agreed and accepted by Unite. The investigation will get underway imminently. In that context, and responding as well to the overtures made by Acas the Conciliation Service, we think there are strong grounds now for at least the suspension of the strike, pending that investigation.

Supplementary – Cllr Latif

Can Council make another genuine attempt to deal with this situation again as a priority and take this issue as an opportunity to help Unite union workers to get what they deserve, and Cardiff residents will get timely bin collections and clean roads?

Reply - Cllr Thomas

We continue to engage with Unite, the offer of dialogue continues to be there, we also clearly continue to engage with the other trade unions recognised by Cardiff Council and recognise that the majority of the workforce within the areas taking industrial action, the majority of the workforce are actually still working, and you see

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

that in turn reflected in that, in the main, delivery of vital waste and recycling services are continuing, so we will continue to try and ensure that whilst of course seeking to bring this dispute to a mutually agreed conclusion as well.

Cllr Robinson to Cllr De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning

The introduction of the 20mph speed limit has been a positive step forwards towards safer streets in our communities for pedestrians, cyclists, and drivers alike. However, some motorists continue to engage in reckless driving behaviour, especially during school times, jeopardising the safety of vulnerable road users and young children. Can the Cabinet Member say what steps the Council will take to address the road safety concerns of residents of Paget Street in Grangetown; specifically what measures can be put in place to deter and penalise reckless driving behaviour please?

Reply – Cllr De'Ath

In terms of enforcement will obviously after these changes came in, there was a grace period, is now coming to an end and enforcement is budgeting, but there's a joint operation cooperation again in South Wales police go safe, looking to penalise and educate drivers found going over the limit as a local authority was doing a lot of analysis around compliance. We're doing it over a 12-month period of which, until we're not really looking to put any physical interventions in by the end of that time, we do a lot of assessments and where we feel that we need extra enforcement or speedbumps. Although much of that time we'll be looking to make decisions based on robust evidence and hopefully the area you raise or full part of that work.

Supplementary – Cllr Robinson

Given that the issues here actually long predate the introduction of 20mph, could the Cabinet Member commit to giving urgent consideration to traffic calming measures, including exploring vehicle activated speed signs, on Paget Street please?

Reply – Cllr De'Ath

I will certainly discuss with my officials what we might be able to do. We've just started a piece of work with Transport for Wales, road traffic neighbourhoods, and I think it really lends itself to that work, but that won't be quick, I'm afraid. But I'll have to talk to you about what we have planned.

Cllr Robson to Cllr Wild, Cabinet Member for Climate Change

Following the short notice cancellation of 2023's Christmas tree collection, what plans will the Cabinet Member make to ensure the 2024 collection occurs should strike action still be ongoing?

Reply – Cllr Wild

I am an optimist, so I would hope that by next winter the strike action would be finished, and I'm happy for you to hold me to that Cllr Robson. But obviously we're undertaking some consultation at the moment around garden waste collections, undertaking lots of analysis around how we can provide an efficient service, and it's actually interesting, isn't it, in terms of Christmas trees, because they weren't collected, actually we weren't inundated with calls, it was interesting how people managed to get their Christmas trees to the recycling centre, to the drop off zone, so lots of analysis still to do in terms the most efficient way of collecting Christmas trees.

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

Supplementary – Cllr Robson

It did cause inconvenience for many people. The drop off at Heath Park was obviously appreciated, but nonetheless there are a number of people who couldn't get to that and especially of course since the Council shut Wedal Road and Waungron Road recycling facilities under a Labour Council, they've been shut over the last decade or so, it really is having an impact and people still miss those. So whilst I will hold you to that plea next year about the Christmas tree collection, I would urge you to actually get the strike resolved, and the rest of the Cabinet as well, to get the strike resolved because it is having an impact on residents and they are getting fed up of it, and to be honest Councillors I think are getting a bit fed up of having to field the calls from understandably frustrated residents when the bin collections, be it a cancelled Christmas tree collection or a miss or cancelled recycling collection changed at very short notice. So get the strike sorted.

Reply – Cllr Wild

I don't think there was a question there, but I appreciate your efforts, and it's not easy is it, there has been some pressure on the city, we recognise that, there's no hiding that. We're really grateful to the staff for the work they've done for residents when they call things in. In the main we've managed to just about get the collection completed and keep things ticking over, so that is appreciated.

Cllr Carter to Cllr Burke, Cabinet Member for Culture, Parks and Events

Before Christmas the Council promised to publish the revised plans for the Pentwyn Leisure Centre refurbishment early in the New Year. Could you please confirm when these revised plans will be published?

Reply – Cllr Burke

I'd like to thank you and Cllr Naughton and Cllr Moultrie for their understanding and patience. There is a delay attributed to the thorough consideration of consultation responses and an effort to ensure that the financial aspects align effectively. I'm committed with officers to delivering a well-thought-out plan and I anticipate having an updated plan for you soon. I anticipate your supplementary question, I was going to write to you and if you're happy for me to write to you and Cllr Naughton and Cllr Moultrie to invite you to a meeting so we can discuss it in more detail.

Supplementary – Cllr Carter

Thank you for the offer of the meeting, I'm sure we all appreciate that diary depending. In terms of a supplementary, I suppose my question is, how can how can we expect residents and indeed ourselves as councillors to respect the timescales given to us when we have very amicable meetings with yourself and officials and we are shown things in private and we agree to wait publicly until these things can be public, and then things are just pushed back and pushed back again? So I'm curious to get your thoughts on how we can ensure that timescales promised are met.

Reply – Cllr Burke

I hope that in your dealings with me as Cabinet Member you have come to appreciate that I try and be as honest as I can with the information I have. There are things that are fluid, certainly I'm working with officers to ensure that what we come

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

forward with to you and Cllr Naughton and Cllr Moultrie is cost effective, is doable, and takes into consideration the best wishes and hopes of the local community. You have been incredibly patient, you have been amicable, and I thank you for that, and I'm just asking you to hold on for a little bit longer and then hopefully we can get this nailed down and come to you and to the local residents with something that is achievable and cost effective.

Cllr Ash-Edwards to Cllr De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning

What steps are being taken to stop rogue paving companies advertising illegally in public spaces and what process is in place to prevent the installation of frontage paving that doesn't meet appropriate standards for construction?

Reply - Cllr De'Ath

Shared Regulatory Services, Highways, and the police conduct joint operations where this kind of behaviour is particularly prevalent, that's mainly Rhiwbina and Heath. We use powers we have under section 132 of the Highways Act to remove this kind of illegal advertising. In the past two months we've removed 400 signs, which is pretty impressive. SRS also does extensive leafletting informing people of their rights as consumers, saying that if you're having work done it needs to be by an accredited business and telling them how to complain if they are not happy with the work that's been done. To date, to my understanding, you might contradict me, we haven't had any complaints about work that's been done in these areas. If you do know people who are unhappy, please let me know and we can take that up with officers.

Supplementary – Cllr Ash-Edwards

I just wanted to reference the activities of certain paving companies in the areas of the cities you've mentioned Cllr De'Ath, and in particular the intimidatory environment they are creating, so I just wanted really to ask you to further commit to making sure that those activities are tackled in the way you've talked about to eliminate them from our streets.

Reply – Cllr De'Ath

Absolutely Councillor, and if you have any specific examples of that happening, please let us know and we'll investigate.

Cllr Lancaster to Cllr De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning
Can you please confirm which bus companies will be operating under the new Central Bus Station?

Reply – Cllr De'Ath

As you will be aware, the new bus station is being operated by Transport for Wales, I imagine the answer will be most of the companies, but the exact details will be announced by them nearer to the time.

Supplementary – Cllr Lancaster

I was hoping for a little bit more detail, because rumours are flying around that the likes of some of the longer distance coach operators such as Megabus and National

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

Express won't actually be able to use the new coach station because indeed the bays have been designed too small for them. Is that true and if so, who is responsible for this farce?

Reply – Cllr De’Ath

It's not really a question of the design of the bays, but the particular companies you mentioned were never intended to use the bus station, but we're so close to opening, it's going to open, it should be wonderful and its functionality will be announced nearer to the time.

Cllr Taylor to Cllr Thorne, Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities

What steps are being taken to improve the quality of private rented sector accommodation in the city?

Reply – Cllr Thorne

Rent Smart Wales, which is delivered by Cardiff Council, is securing improved property management practices and better standards by raising sector awareness of standards and behaviours required by landlords and agents. This is reinforced with a robust enforcement regime. Service performance is publicly accessible using interactive dashboards on Rent Smart Wales. In addition, the housing enforcement team within Shared Regulatory Services deals with complaints from private sector tenants, carrying out inspections for hazards such as damp and mould, excess cold and fire safety. Complaints continue to be received at a very high level during the current housing crisis. Where landlords fail to comply with the enforcement provisions, the Council may prosecute with fines exceeding £120,000 for a variety of offences.

The housing enforcement team also runs two additional licensing schemes for houses in multiple occupation, with over 1,000 HMOs inspected so far this year to ensure compliance with standards. I would also refer you to page 4 of my statement, which provides information on the LETS scheme which also helps to improve properties in the private rented sector.

Supplementary – Cllr Taylor

Thank you for the response and for including that information about the enforcement activity as well. The reason I ask is that before Christmas statistics were already showing that Cardiff was one of the cities with the highest level of mould damp and poor rented accommodation in the UK, and my concern is that our increasing reliance on the PRS to discharge homelessness due to the people who are facing homelessness, is that the supply of quality private rented sector accommodation may not necessarily be available. So I'm interested to know what steps are being taken to ensure that where people who are facing homelessness are offered private sector accommodation, that the accommodation being offered is of high quality and that landlords are engaged with that enforcement process and that maintenance of high standards.

Reply – Cllr Thorne

I would urge you to read my statement and the paragraph on page 4 about the LETS scheme, which actually shows that we actually also provide grants for private landlords to improve their properties and the LETS scheme take those properties on

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

to let to homeless families, so we do as much as we possibly can to ensure that those people who are homeless and who have found private accommodation by us, it's good quality accommodation, but you need to understand that very often people who are homeless find their own private rented accommodation. We may help them with bonds and rent in advance, but sometimes they can do that for themselves. We do as much as we possibly can.

Cllr Moultrie to Cllr De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning

After the 51/53 bus service was removed in Pentwyn, many residents, especially the elderly, feel that they do not have access to public transport. Can the Council confirm what they are doing to address this, please?

Reply – Cllr De'Ath

We have put in place the 101/102 service, which covers the last part of the route of the 51/53. I can confirm to you we are looking to try and bring back the 51/53 service. I can't guarantee we'll be able to do that, it depends on funding and a variety of other things, but officers are working to try and restore that service. I know it's something you and the other members of the ward feel very strongly about, I know Cllr Carter has had a petition, but you particularly have held my feet to the fire at transport team and fight on behalf of your residents and you should be very proud of the work you've done.

Cllr McEvoy to Cllr Weaver, Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation and Performance

What process exists for service users to amend Council reports with errors in them and about them and their cases, other than formal complaints processes?

Reply - Cllr Weaver

There is something called a rectification right under the UK GDPR rules which individuals, residents of the city can invoke if they think the Council holds incorrect personal data about them. Those requests can be submitted in the same way as a subject access request. There is a section on the website around FOI and data protection which has a bit more information about that, so hopefully that's useful and answers your question.

Supplementary – Cllr McEvoy

That is very useful information, but it doesn't really answer my question because this is cross-departmental, it involves every council in Wales really, every council in the UK, because there is some really fundamental reports written about people in all different areas of council business, and reports are written and when they go wrong, when there are errors of facts, I don't mean opinion, I mean errors of facts which can be evidenced and disproved, there really isn't any mechanism that I can see to rectify that quickly, and lives are being ruined, absolutely destroyed by mistakes, whether they be deliberate or not. So the question is, would you consider setting up departmental hit squads, so people could complain very quickly, and it could be looked at and evidenced and if it is correct the report is corrected immediately because, as it stands now there is a complaints process which takes months?

Reply – Cllr Weaver

I think you might be raising a serious question around personal information, I think it is important. Councils want to keep personal data accurately and correctly and within the law. I am not sure what reports you're referring to, so I'm not sure the extent of the issue you're trying to address. I'd be very happy if you want the team and myself, you said it was cross-departmental, so very happy for that to come to me and to have a look at ways. But there is a right for people who think their personal data is held inaccurately by the Council that currently exists, so I'd encourage people to use that. We're always looking to improve our services in any practical way.

Cllr Williams to Cllr Wild, Cabinet Member for Climate Change

Cardiff Council continues to demand Cardiff residents continue to pay more for less. With Council Tax bills continuing to rise and frontline services being cut back, residents are rightly questioning the Council's priorities. The Council are considering moving black bin collections from once fortnightly to once three-weekly. The Council is also considering charging for green bin collections. How much does the Council plan to save by charging for green bin collections and moving black bin collections to once three-weekly? Please provide a breakdown and methodology.

Reply - Cllr Wild

The Council has got really stretched budgets, we're having to look at all sorts of different things, we're quite rightly asking the public their views on a variety of different things so it can get us a settled balanced budget. We want loads of people to take part, give us their views on it so we can come up with the best and fairest budget for the people of Cardiff.

Supplementary – Cllr Williams

I asked you a very simple question, Cllr Wild, how much does the Council plan to save by charging for green bin collections and moving black bin collections to once three-weekly. In order for you to put that to the public in a consultation, you surely must have a figure in mind for how much you plan to save, so come on, let's hear it.

Reply – Cllr Wild

In terms of the budget consultation, there's a figure in there in terms of what it costs in terms of garden waste, £1.5 million a year it costs us. The other stuff we're still having to work through, so we do need people to feed in. But in reality this is all moot. We've been through all the different conversations this evening in terms of the pressures, and the Tory doctrine just isn't sitting comfortably with anyone in Cardiff. You can't just cut public services all over the UK, as even the Tory MPs are agreeing, and then come here and plead poverty and ask that everything is safe. So when we get to those consultations, we'd really like to see what you've got to do, and in terms of interventions, I wonder if there's been any interventions from your group to the Tory government pleading. Have you made any interventions in terms of that? Any intervention your party? The last intervention I saw that you made with a UK parliamentary party was to support the prime minister, Liz Truss.

Cllr Shimmin to Cllr Burke, Cabinet Member for Culture, Parks and Events

Could the Cabinet Member please provide an update for the physical future of the Museum of Cardiff given that it has to move from its current location in the old library, and if no decision has been made, when can we expect this decision and the timeframe for the move?

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

Reply – Cllr Burke

A working party of Council officers and Development Trustees of the museum was set up and established to review the museum's long-term financing and consider options for an alternative site. As part of the work programme a feasibility study has been conducted to assess the viability of the move to a new location and outline how the museum would operate at a curatorial and operational level ensuring a sustainable future. This work is scheduled to be completed in March and presented to the Cabinet later this year. The timeframe for the move would be dependent on the outcome of the feasibility study and the options available to us, however, we have made a commitment to vacate the Old Library after five years.

Supplementary – Cllr Shimmin

Could the Cabinet Member please give assurances that any move will adhere to the recommendations put out in the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee's museum inquiry report, especially and including its recommendations around gallery size and location in respect to other attractions and its location in the city?

Reply – Cllr Burke

That will be taken into consideration when we have a look at the report, it obviously depends on what's available. We have an idea in mind of what we're looking for, but until we have all the recommendations from the feasibility studies to take into consideration as well, I can't make that guarantee today, but I am pushing for something.

Cllr McGarry to Cllr Thorne, Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities

I see that the Chancellor in his Autumn Statement announced an increase in the Local Housing Allowance. Will this remove the requirement for many of those renting in the private rented sector to top up their rent?

Reply – Cllr Thorne

The indicative Local Housing Allowance rates for 2024/25 were issued recently, with final figures expected at the end of this month. I am pleased to say that the new figures represent a considerable increase. The monthly increase in rates ranges from an increase of £124.66 for a 1-bed flat – that's an increase of 23.81% – to an increase of £394.05 per month for a 4-bed property, which is an increase of 36.84%.

While this increase is very welcome and will help many households on benefit to afford their rent, the demand for private rented properties is so high that the average rent levels in the city are still above these rates, so there will be still some challenges for some households.

Supplementary – Cllr McGarry

Do you think that this rise in the local housing rate will make it more affordable for families to rent in the private rented sector, given that the estimated shortfall between the Local Housing Allowance and the average rental is still quite significant, for example for a two bedroom home a shortfall of £172 per month and a three-bedroom home £277 per month shortfall? This is still a large amount of money for families with low incomes to find.

Reply – Cllr Thorne

As I said, it is very welcome because people are paying hundreds of pounds topping up, they will pay less, but it will be still challenging, and particularly because we still have austerity on the doorstep and all the inflation things that are with us. So it's welcome but it's not enough.

Cllr Driscoll to Councillor Bradbury, Cabinet Member for Tackling Poverty and Supporting Young People

The recently published report by 'Centre For Cities' shows that between 2014 and 2021, children in relative poverty in working households in Cardiff has increased by 21%. How does that figure compare to other UK core cities?

Reply – Cllr Bradbury

Thank you for the question and raising the important subject of child poverty, a matter which is very important to all of us. The report authors and the DWP, whose data the analysis is based on, are explicit in saying that the data should not be used for comparison between Wales and England as the data from 2019 onwards is not reliable.

If we look at trends up until 2019 however – when the data is reliable – the rise in actual relative child poverty in Cardiff is 11%, not 21%. This is consistent with the increases with other core cities. So, Cardiff is in no way an outlier here, but this is deeply worrying nonetheless.

So, let's talk about why this is happening across all cities and towns in England and Wales. The Cities Outlook 2024 finds that since 2010:

Productivity growth – the key driver of higher wages – is poor across all cities.

Disposable income growth is weak as a result of economic stagnation, so people were £10,000 worse off in 2021 than they would have been if the economy had continued to grow at pre-2010 levels.

Housing became less affordable in almost every place during the 2010s, and, as a result, rates of children in poverty have risen in almost every city.

At the same time, we have seen cuts to the real value of working-age benefits since 2011, the freezing of child benefits, and the capping of local housing allowances.

Here in Cardiff, we are investing record amounts in education, prioritising opportunities for young people through the Cardiff Commitment, creating good quality jobs and making sure everyone can access these opportunities through affordable public transport.

So, for all children and families across Cardiff who are living in poverty, our message is clear, our administration is doing everything we can within the levers we have, to support them.

Supplementary – Cllr Driscoll

I suppose, firstly, I should congratulate the whole team on Cardiff Youth Service for the well-deserved Civil Award quality mark for youth work, recognising the positive impact on young people's lives, and I know this we've spoken about this before and is something close to your heart too. I dispute the figure that you have because it was announced in the Senedd last week as well, which wasn't disputed. There's no getting away that this week the Children's Commissioner said the latest report into child poverty strategy is shameful, because it is not measurable and because it has no target dates to achieve long-term goals that have been set.

I know we've both got interest in sports clubs and the community volunteer groups play an important role in providing support for youngsters, improving health and wellbeing, social skills and a sense of belonging. Welsh Government have also removed funding for school meals during school holidays, so I'd like to know, do you regret that Welsh Government have remove this funding for school meals during school holidays for vulnerable families that need it?

Reply – Cllr Bradbury

I always regret children going hungry at any time and I think everybody should regret children going hungry at any time during any period or at all, and I made my views perfectly clear on that issue and I've made it clear in this Chamber on that issue. But Sean, we're friends, but you're still member of a party that has seen 2 million more children go into poverty since 2010. The record prior to that, from 1997 to 2010 was the polar opposite, a million children were lifted out of poverty and when you cut benefits value and you cut real-term wage increases, and you limit the opportunity for people to go out and top up their work with working family tax credits like your party has, this is the result, and to coin a phrase that Rishi Sunak's been using, if you ask me what I'd want I'd want us to go back to square one, get a Labour government in that actually will invest in children, in dealing with this issue. Absolute poverty has fallen in Cardiff though by 3.7% between 2014 and 2021.

Cllr Hopkins to Cllr Merry, Deputy Leader & Cabinet Member for Education

What impact is the three-mile rule having on attendance in Cardiff's secondary schools?

Reply – Cllr Merry

The Education Welfare Team does not assess attendance based on impact of ability to travel to schools. Where there is an identified need, then we are supporting families. For example, we used the Welsh Government attendance grant to buy 426 bus passes in the Autumn term. The majority of these were for families in temporary accommodation, but 90 were for families in severe financial hardship who would have been unable to fund the bus fare to get to school.

Supplementary – Cllr Hopkins

I know you have expressed concerns in scrutiny about the challenge currently associated with getting attendance rates back to where they were pre-pandemic. You will no doubt have seen the recent Estyn report *Improving Attendance in Secondary Schools*. The report makes the point that pupils who usually walk to school, especially those eligible for free school meals, did not attend as often, and that some young people are missing school because they cannot afford transport and live just under the 3-mile rule. Estyn makes a recommendation that the

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

Welsh Government should review the three-mile rule and that free transport should be extended to help get secondary aged pupils back to school. Notwithstanding the provision that you've already outlined, is this something that this administration will support as a recommendation?

Reply – Cllr Merry

I would certainly support the Welsh Government reviewing those guidelines. The choice of three miles as a distance is based upon the fact that it's argued that children could walk to school as opposed to the cost of transport. I personally think that 3 miles to and from school is too far, even though I support active travel as my preferred option for children. But as a local authority we wouldn't be able to do that independently unless we were able to see the finances for exactly the reasons we discussed earlier. And we would need to be able to sustain it because to introduce it and then take it back would be the worst option of all.

Cllr Ferguson-Thorne to Cllr Lister, Cabinet Member for Children's Services

It has been a year since Cabinet passed the Children's Services accommodation strategy; can the Cabinet member provide an update on the progress of the implementation of this?

Reply - Cllr Lister

I'd like to start again by putting on record my tribute and thanks to the Council officers not just in Children's Services, but in Education, Economic Development and Housing, for actually working so hard on the strategy, because in the last 12 months we've managed to source, refurbish, redecorate and recruit staff to work in and register 3 new properties with Care Inspectorate Wales that are now operational. We've got an additional home in the final stages of registration with Care Inspectorate Wales, and another four homes have been purchased by the Council and are currently going through refurbishment with the handover expected within the next six weeks. Another large property, five self-contained flats, which I personally visited with offices, is currently going through registration as well, and is being used with an in-house team of staff to accommodate some of our children and young people who were previously living in properties that were operating without registration. So we're going through those processes as quickly as possible, we are being ambitious, we're working towards the Welsh Government's Eliminate Profit target, but actually focusing on ensuring that we've got the best possible placements for children and young people in the city, that they are within our care or the care of a third party in the not-for-profit sector as well.

Supplementary – Cllr Ferguson-Thorne

I welcome your update and would like to extend my own thanks to yourself and staff across Children's Services, who are clearly passionate and committed to ensuring children and families are provided the right support at the right time. I particularly welcome the commitment, through this strategy, to reducing the time children and young people have to spend in residential care settings. Can the Cabinet Member therefore advise us whether there has been a reduction in time spent in residential care settings over the last year?

Reply – Cllr Lister

I don't have the figures to hand but I can definitely check on them, because as you say that is the key part of this piece of work, it's not just about removing profit from the sector, it's actually having placements that are available, that suit a young person's needs, and actually that right place model, so will support them in the right place at the right time with the right people means there is a fluid kind of placement. Residential isn't going to be the best for everyone; foster care, kinship care are great options that we're extending as a local authority, but for some children residential care is the best. So I'll definitely look at those figures for you and share them.

Cllr Melbourne (on behalf of Cllr Cowan) to Cllr Thorne, Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities

Has the Cabinet Member had any discussions during this budget round about potentially closing any libraries?

Reply – Cllr Thorne

During the debate on the motion, when Councillor Moultrie wound up, she said about 780 libraries closed. I'm pleased to say across Cardiff we haven't closed one library and in fact the debate has also been about poverty and actually, by being innovative and introducing new services, the hubs, which provide services for those people who really are struggling financially, we've kept all open and all running well, and I know, by all parties, respected.

Our commitment to our hubs and library service is clear, with investment in Rhiwbina, Rhydypenau and Whitchurch libraries, all of which have been refurbished to create new hubs offering a range of facilities. However, as you will be aware, we're currently facing significant financial pressures which will be very challenging, so a wide range of savings options were considered to meet the budget gap, including a number of proposals, some that were rejected by Cabinet. These rejected proposals did include the closure of some hubs and libraries. I am pleased to say that the proposals have been included in the public consultation are those that make savings while minimising the impact on services, such as reducing opening times and the renting out of meeting rooms in hubs. This will ensure that these important facilities remain available across the city.

Cllr Latif to Cllr Thorne, Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities

Is the Council taking into account that reducing library hours, which could include closing them for an extra day each week and possibly on Saturday afternoons, will have a significant effect on students by reducing their access to education and information?

Reply – Cllr Thorne

I would agree that the availability of library services is crucial to supporting young people's educational opportunities, and that's why we've invested in our hub and library information across the city. However, as I said previously, the Council needs to address a significant budget gap and we have no option but to propose some changes to hub and library opening hours. The saving under consideration as part of the budget proposals is a flexible one. The public consultation is still ongoing and we'd like to hear people's views. However, any proposed changes to opening hours have been developed using a careful analysis of current customer footfall, and

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

I would advise all Council members, if you look at the written questions, in one of the written answers it gives you the footfall across all of our hubs and libraries so that you can look and see how your hub is faring.

Supplementary – Cllr Latif

We do understand the cuts you have to make, but can the Council please commit to doing everything possible to not close libraries during college and university students' exam and holiday times so it doesn't impact directly on their grades and future prospects?

Reply – Cllr Thorne

I can certainly ask officers to look at that.

106 : URGENT BUSINESS

There was no urgent business.

107 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

Council was asked to receive nominations and make appointments to current committee vacancies as set out in the report and in accordance with the approved allocation of seats and political group wishes.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Receive a nomination and appoint to the vacancy on the Committee, in accordance with the Party Group wishes, as set out in Table A and on the Amendment Sheet.

108 : APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNORS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

Council was asked to appoint Local Authority School Governors to fill vacancies in accordance with the recommendations of the Local Authority Governor Panel.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Approve the new appointments of Local Authority Governors to the school Governing Bodies as set out in Appendix 1, each for a term of 4 years from the date of the appointment, in accordance with the recommendations of the Local Authority Governor Panel.

109 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 17(f), Written Questions received for consideration together with the responses will be attached to the minutes.